The Comparison of Schema therapy & Theatre therapy with Schema Concept on alexithymia On War Devotes Physical Handicap over 35 Percent In Isfahan City

ARMITANOOIEN, PHD STUDENT,
MOHAMMAD BAGHERKAJBAF ,ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR
DEPARTMENT OF PSYCHOLOGY
UNIVERSITY OF ISFAHAN

GHOTBEDI S ADEGHI, ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR
DEPARTMENT OF THEATRE
UNIVERSITY OF TEHRAN

HOSSEINMULAVI, PROFESSOR
DEPARTMENT OF PSYCHOLOGY
UNIVERSITY OF ISFAHAN

Abstract
The purpose of this study was to comparison the effect of theatre therapy with schema concept with schema therapy on the alexithymia of war devotes physical handicaps of more than 35 percent in Esfahan City. 30 imposed war crippled subjects were chosen in random cluster sampling and were placed in two experimental (theatre therapy with schema concept & schema therapy) and control groups. Before setting up the first therapy meetings, the FTAS-20 & DSM scales were administered to 3 groups. Then the experimental group1 received theatre therapy with schema concept for 6 weeks and each week for 2 ninety minute sessions. The experimental group2 received schema therapy for 6 weeks and each week for 2 ninety minute sessions. Immediately after this step the FTAS-20 scale & DSM interview were administered as the post- test & 1 month later as the follow up tests to all groups. FTAS-20 scale has 3 subscales: difficulties in identifying & describing emotions and thinking objectively. One factor analysis in data discovered 2 items: difficulties in identifying & describing emotions. Then covariance analysis showed that theatre therapy with schema concept & schema therapy could successfully significantly reduce difficulties in identifying & describing emotions in post & follow up level (p<0.0001). Covariance analysis showed that theatre therapy with schema concept & schema therapy could successfully significantly reduce thinking objectively in post & follow up level (p<0.0001). Also the comparison between the results of theatre therapy with schema concept & schema therapy showed that theatre therapy with schema concept is more successful reduce the difficulties in identifying & describing emotions in post & follow up level than schema therapy group (p<0.0001). The comparison between the results of theatre therapy with schema concept & schema therapy showed that theatre therapy with schema concept is more successful reduce the thinking objectively in post & follow up level than schema therapy group.

Use of schema therapy & theatre therapy with schema concept can helpful to improvement emotional disorder & use of art of theatre is more useful in this subject.

Keywords: Schema Therapy, Theatre Therapy With Schema Concept, War Divotes
Introduction

Currently, emotional health has been considerably noticed by psychologists as one the main aspects of health. According to Brown (1999) an emotionally healthy individual is able to recognize and express his emotional state. The ability to understand and express emotional states has received increased interest by many psychologists (Ciarrochi&Capooti, 2000). The later is an ability that was called emotional literacy. Emotional literacy is about identification and exchange of feelings as well as meeting the needs (Frishman&Robina, 2004; Freshwater, 2004). New and emerging theories of emotion emphasize positive and adaptive role of emotion and show that emotion could have constructive effect on problem solving, information processing, decision-making and learning. Emotion regulation is defined as processes through which individuals could intervene in the type, time and manifestation of their emotions (Gross, 1998).

Psychological studies and literature review indicated that emotion regulation is a vital factor in successful performance in social interactions and deficits in emotion regulation is associated with disorders such as depression, anxiety, social isolation, aggressive behavior and delinquency (Eisenberg, 2001). Past philosophers and psychologists believed that emotion and cognition are two separate concepts. Furthermore, they believed that cognition is an unreliable and nonsignificant issue. On the contrary, recent psychological studies indicated that emotion could affect thinking, judgments and behaviors of human beings. In other words, it could affect human’s health (Forgas, 2000). Thus, mental health professionals especially psychotherapist and counselors have been made efforts to improve emotions via the processes of prevention and treatment. Early identification and treatment of emotional disorders is the first stage of such processes. Alexithymia, as an emotional–cognitive phenomenon is defined as a specific disorder in mental performance. It is the result of the automatic inhibition of emotional information and feelings. Some scientists believe that the disturbance of the limbic system, abnormal lateralization and inefficient communication between brain hemispheres are key factors in creating this disorder. Alexithymia in fourth edition of The Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM) is not categorized as a mental disorder. To put it differently, it is a mental characteristic with varying intensities. As an illustration, the prevalence of Alexithymia is 40 percent for PTSD disorder, 63 percent for anorexia nervosa, 45 percent for major depression, 34 percent for panic disorder, and 50 percent for drug abuse (Wikipedia).

Alexithymia is defined as difficulty in emotional self-regulation. Differently stated, it is a fundamental inability in cognitive processing of emotional information as well as emotion regulation (bagby,1997,lane,1997, taylor,2000). The associated features of this disorder include inability to identify and verbally
describe emotions and feelings as well as the absence of symbolic thinking that limits the feedbacks, feelings, desires and drives. Other symptoms are inability to use emotions, abstract thinking about minor external events, decreased dream recalls, contrast between emotional states and bodily sensations, Apathetic faces, loss of facial expressions and limited capacity for empathy and self-awareness (Trull, 2005). Ambivalence in emotional expression is negatively correlated with appropriate expression of emotions. (Mongrain, 2006.)

Studies regarding time stability of Alexithymia (Pinard, 1996; Saarijarvi, 2001, Salminen, 2006; Martinez, 2003, 1998) confirmed this construction as a stable personality trait that is the result of the deficits in cognitive processing of emotional information (Taylor, 2000). In contrast with this trait-centered approach, other studies investigated the time stability of Alexithymia and introduced it as a consequence of psychological distress. In this approach, Alexithymia is a state not a trait (Honkalampi, 2000, Haviland, 1998). According to this later approach, Alexithymia is a coping mechanism to protect individuals against a deeply emotional distress associated with a traumatic situation. When perceiving and evaluating emotional information through cognitive processing is impossible, people would experience emotional and cognitive distress and confusion. This inability disrupts a person’s system of emotion and cognition (Sifneos, 1973). People who suffer from Alexithymia have shallow’ emotions, and they are unable to gain insight into their behaviors and motivations. They often experience abnormalities in their physiological function. Stress, anxiety and tendency to stay away from interpersonal relations are common among such people.


to reduced Alexithymia symptoms. Yalug (2010) investigated correlations between Alexithymia and pain severity, depression, and anxiety among patients with chronic and episodic migraine. The results of the study demonstrated a positive association between depression, anxiety, and Alexithymia in both groups of migraine patients. Schema therapy is one of methods of treatment based on the principles of cognitive-behavioral therapy. Schema therapy as one of the cognitive approaches in counseling and therapy mainly based on the idea that common behavioral and emotional problems are originated from people's belief system about objects and affairs. This faulty belief system contributes to inappropriate emotional consequences such as anger and depression. Several studies investigated the relationship between cognitive systems (Schema) and emotional disorders such as depression, anxiety, anger and emotional inhibition (Calvete, 2002; Harris, 2006; Wild, 2004; Moller, 2000; Robinson, 2002). All the proposed remedies emphasized adaption with. Due to the damages that alexithymia as the emotional disorder can causes, the mental health experts such as psychologists try to treat this disorder in this research tried schema therapy & theatre therapy with schema concept as the new method to be used.

Young (1999-1990) developed schema therapy for chronic Axis I disorders that were not improved by classic cognitive-behavioral therapy. He integrated different techniques into a unified and systematic approach that expanded the boundaries of mental treatment. Schema therapy is established based on classic cognitive-behavioral therapy. The main focus of the therapy is the idea that psychological problems’ origins could be traced back in childhood and adolescence. Schema therapy is defined within a specific framework. Incognitive therapy domain, schema theory was first proposed Back (1967). From his point of view, schema is a part of total mental system and it is necessary in order to understand life experiences. The eighteen schemas have been divided into five broad categories of needs known as domains. These domains are as follows: disconnection and rejection (abandonment - instability, mistrust, abuse, emotional deprivation, defectiveness - shame, social isolation – alienation, social undesirability and failure to achieve), impaired autonomy and performance (dependence/ incompetence, vulnerability to harm and illness, enmeshment/ undeveloped self and failure), impaired limits (Entitlement/ Self-centeredness, insufficient self-control/self-discipline(low frustration tolerance), other-directness(subjugation, self-Sacrifice and approval-seeking), overvigilance and inhibition (Negativity/ Vulnerability to Error, overcontrol/emotional inhibition and unrelenting standards/hypocriticalness). The primary goal of schema therapy is achieving psychological awareness. Therapists help patients to understand their schemas at the same time they help patients to recognize their memories, emotions, physical sensations, coping
styles and schemas. Patients who are able to understand their schemas and coping styles would be capable to control their responses to some extent. Two main treatments for schemas are continuity and improvement. The final goal of schema therapy is improving schemas. The therapy process includes cognitive, emotional and behavioral interventions. Schemas are hard to change because they are deeply linked with an individual’s beliefs regarding himself and his surroundings. Improving schemas necessitates strong will to fight old schemas as well as practice and discipline.

There different methods to treat Alexithymia. One of the common psychotherapy methods is psychodrama. Psychodrama is purposeful use of drama and theater in order to achieve specific goals such as symptoms improvement, physical and emotional integration and personal transformation (Casson, 2006). The main purpose of psychotherapist is breaking patients’ rigid thoughts cycle that hinders their change and evolution. Art has similar effect on people. Art is the source of freedom and beauty. Since the adventure of history, drama has been relieved human sufferings by offering freedom, beauty, dream, and myth. Music, dance, dumbshow and other types of drama have been noticed as human needs from the view point of actors and audiences. Paying attention to therapeutic property of drama, it was accepted by experts of psychotherapy and education. Psychodrama consists different methods of psychotherapy in which people play their roles that are based on their personal problems (Stewart, 2001). In this therapy, people in group sessions guided by a therapist and other supportive guides play different roles (Trull, 2001). In fact, selected role are related with what bothers them. Patients show their hidden thoughts and motives on stage and the focus of healing effect of drama is on the actor rather than audience. In this method, psychological dimensions of the problems are reviewed by role playing. Thus, patients could find solutions for them. Psychodrama is a combination of different drama methods (move, sound, dance, role play, drama games, displacement, improvisational theater puppet and mask theater) and group psychotherapy. Psychodrama use scientific findings of psychotherapy, cognitive therapy, psychoanalysis, and group therapy to find a comprehensive treatment (Jennings, 1998). A Drama therapist helps a veteran to act as a protagonist in the safe and pragmatic drama stage. In fact, the veteran feels the past events in the present time and location and different stage’s facilities (light, sound and objects) would help the veteran to have a more vivid imagination. Other members of the group play as important people of the veteran’s life or even as a part within himself. All the stage is his realized life through which he could examine himself comprehensively. Drama therapy techniques are used for him and finally he could discover his purified self. All the past responses that created an environment filled with negative reinforcement would be deleted in partnership with therapist and other members.
of the group. Finally, he could select the best behavior and response and use it real life as well.

From the psychodrama point of view, modern human beings need behavioral flexibility. Emotional disorders including Alexithymia is due to lack of spontaneity, undeveloped roles and social skills (, Moreno,2000 ). Vanheule (2011) investigated atherapeutic framework for Alexithymia .Theatre therapy in various sources has different meanings .sometimes theatre therapy means the therapy that has not any piece and all the procedures occurs spontaneity but sometimes it means the procedures that have a piece and the patients play the roles and the target is the treatment with this playing. In this research the piece written( by drghotbedinsadeghi associate professor of theatre) based on schema therapy .and its comparison with schema therapy. It’s the first research with this concept.

Methodology
Participants
The population of the study included all the 365 veterans of Isfahan city with over 35% physical disabilities in 2012. Thirty subjects were selected by random sampling method and they divided in to two experimental groups and one control group. The first experimental group was treated with theatre therapy with schema concept for 12one-hour sessions. The second experimental group received 12 one-hour sessions of schema therapy. The control group received no intervention. Before the first session of therapy, all the participants were evaluated with DSM-IV-TR clinical interview tooland Farsi version of the Toronto Alexithymia Scale-20 (FTAS-20). In the same vein, after the last treatment session the entire participants completed above tools as post-test & 1 month later s follow up test. The obtained data were analyzed with SPSS software and the obtained results were presented in two sections of inferential and descriptive statistics.

Instruments
1- DSM-IV-TR clinical interview
2- Farsi version of the Toronto Alexithymia Scale-20 (FTAS-20).

The Toronto Alexithymia Scale-20 (FTAS-20): it is a 20-item test with three subscales; namely, Difficulty Describing Feelings (DIF) (7 items ) , Difficulty Identifying Feelings (DDI ) (5 items ) , Externally-Oriented Thinking (GeT) (8 items ) . The responses to the above items quantified based on 5-point Likert scale ( 5= I agree strongly , 4=1 agree , 3= I have no Idea , 2= I disagree , 1= I disagree strongly ). A total score was computed by summing subscales’ scores . The reliability and validity of Toronto test was confirmed by several studies (bagby,1994 ).
The reliability of the Farsi version of Toronto test was determined by calculating Chronbach’s Alpha Coefficient. The reliability of the instruments was 0.79 for the whole instrument and varied from 0.75, 0.71, and 0.66 for DDF, DIF and GET respectively. The test–retest reliability of the whole instrument was 0.77. The reported coefficients were 0.73, 0.69, and 0.65 for DDF, DIF and GET respectively. In this research after analysis the data, the factor analysis was performed on alexithymia scale. three subscales of alexithymia (difficulty in identifying emotions, difficulty in describing emotions and thinking objectively) two factors (difficulty in identifying - describing emotions and thinking objectively) was obtained.

Research Hypothesis:

1- Difficulty in identifying – describing emotions post –test&followup mean scores of therapy groups is different from post-test& follow up mean scores of control group.

2- Thinking objectively post –test&follow up mean scores of therapy groups is different from post-test& follow up mean scores of control group.

3- Difficulty in identifying – describing emotions post –test&follow up mean scores of theatre therapy with schema concept is different from post-test& follow up mean scores of schema group.

4- Thinking objectively post –test&follow up mean scores of theatre therapy with schema concept is different from post-test& follow up mean scores of schema group.

Results:

The Persian form of alexithymia scale has three subscales. factor analysis in alexithymia scales, difficulty in identifying emotions, difficulty in describing emotions and thinking objectively. Analysis concept after analysis data, introduced two factors difficulty in identifying - describing emotions and thinking objectively.
As the results of table 1 showed, three subscales of alexithymia (difficulty in identifying emotions, difficulty in describing emotions, and thinking objectively) were obtained. The investigation of first hypothesis is in table 2.

### Table 1 - Analysis concept of alexithymia scale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>variable</th>
<th>scales</th>
<th>Pre test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>alexithymia</td>
<td>Difficulty in identifying emotions</td>
<td>0/597</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Difficulty in describing emotions</td>
<td>0/811</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Objectively thinking</td>
<td>0/935</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2 - The comparison of difficulty identifying - describing emotions in three groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>stage</th>
<th>Degree free</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>sig</th>
<th>Eta square</th>
<th>Observed power</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Post test</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1007</td>
<td>0/0001</td>
<td>0/74</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow up</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1007</td>
<td>0/0001</td>
<td>0/74</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Diagram 1** - The comparison of difficulty identifying - describing emotions in three groups in post level
Diagram 2 - The comparison of difficulty identifying - describing emotions in three groups in follow level

As the results of table 1& diagram1-2 showed the comparison of schema therapy, theatre therapy with schema concept an control group in post and follow levels are meaningful. The means of this meaningful is 0/74 .that means the 74percent of the individual differences due to the group membership. The suitable Observed power showed the appropriate samples. The investigation of second hypothesis is in table 3.

Table 3- the comparison of objectively thinking in three groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>stage</th>
<th>Degree free</th>
<th>Mean square</th>
<th>sig</th>
<th>Eta square</th>
<th>Observed power</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Post test</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>0/0001</td>
<td>0/88</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow up</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>0/0001</td>
<td>0/88</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Diagram 3 - The comparison of objectively thinking in three groups in post level

Diagram 4 - The comparison objectively thinking in three groups in follow level
As the results of table 3 & diagram 3-4 showed the comparison of schema therapy, theatre therapy with schema concept an control group in post and follow levels are meaningful. The means of this meaningful is 0/88. That means the 88 percent of the individual differences due to the group membership. The suitable Observed power showed the appropriate samples.

The comparison of schema therapy & theatre therapy with schema concept in table 4 as the averages of alexithymia factors (difficulty identifying-describing emotions & objectively thinking) in post and follow levels.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage / subscale</th>
<th>Difficulty In identifying-describing emotions</th>
<th>Objectively thinking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>POST</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schema therapy</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theatre therapy with schema concept</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow up</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schema therapy</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theatre therapy with schema concept</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As the results of table 4 the averages of theatre therapy with schema concept is significantly lower than schema group in alexithymia sub scales. It show that the theatre therapy is more useful in alexithymia improvement.

**Discussion and conclusion**

The purpose of the current study was comparing the effect of theater therapy with schema concept and schema therapy on Alexithymia scales intensity in veterans with over 35% of physical disability. The results of study confirmed the first hypothesis of study (p<0.001). Comparing treatments and control groups, theater therapy with schema concept & schema therapy reduced the rate of difficulty identifying-describing emotions in post & follow up levels. Also the second hypothesis is the comparison between therapy groups & control group...
in objectively thinking in post & follow up level. The result of this hypothesis is confirmed (p<0.001). The results of the current study are in line with the purposes specified in theater therapy & schema therapy. Moreno (2000) believed that clients of psychodrama should be allowed to expose their hidden thoughts, motives and emotional states such as anger, discomfort and happiness. The safe stage of drama therapy is similar to a laboratory. In this laboratory, clients could examine their different responses without being punished. Thus, they can review their responses and select the best one (blanter, 2000). The results of the current study are in line with the results obtained (altman, 2003, carbonel, 1999, banister, 1997). Bannister (1997) investigated the effect of classic theater therapy on sexually abused female teenagers. He found that psychodrama techniques could motivate expressing negative emotions. Moreover, ambivalence and conflict in expressed emotion were reduced in such teenagers. Finally, he observed that psychodrama techniques will lead to increased self-confidence.

Altman (2003), studied stress disorder in abused women. He confirmed that psychodrama sessions would increase the ability to express emotions. Carbonel (1999) investigated the effect of psychodrama groups on the rate compatibility with crisis in female students. He founded that interpersonal relations and expressive behaviors were increased noticeably in such a way that members of the groups could speak freely about their traumatic experiences.

Parisa Zahebi (2004) studied the effect of psychodrama on improving mother-daughter conflict resolution skills. She confirmed that psychodrama could reduce verbal and physical anger.

Schema therapy is one the therapies of cognitive behavioral domain that is invented for people with chronic cognitive behavior problems who could not be treated with classic cognitive behavioral therapy. The main focus of the therapy is the idea that psychological problems’ origins could be traced back in childhood and adolescence. Schema is defined as structure and format (framework) and schema therapy is based on recognition of damaged and damaging structures as well as improvement of such structures.

The Young Schema Questionnaire (YSQ) was filled by all the participants of study in order to assess early 18 maladaptive schemas. Abandonment, instability, mistrust, abuse, emotional deprivation, shame, social isolation, alienation, and dependence/incompetence were more frequent schemas in the sample of the study. The schemas are correlated with anger and sadness emotions. Schema therapy is concentrated on improving Alexithmia by decreasing anger and sadness. As it was shown in the results of the second hypothesis of the study, the rate of improvement was statically significant.

The results of the second hypothesis of the study are in line with the results obtained by Dehghani (2009), Yaghobi (2002), Nasrparvaran (2010), Hamidpor (2010) and Jafar Shirzadeh (2011).

Fagimeh Dehghani (2009) in her study investigated the effect of stress management-as a cognitive-behavioral therapy– on anxiety and depression in women with alopecia areata.
Her findings indicated that cognitive behavioral therapy reduced the anxiety and depression symptoms in those patients.

Yaghobi (2004) studied the effect of cognitive behavioral group therapy on the rate of depression and anxiety in patients with mood disorder. The obtained results supported the efficacy of exercise to reduce depression and anxiety \((p<0.05)\).

Honarparvaran (2010) concluded that schema therapy could reduce early maladaptive schemas associated with depression in women.

Hamidpor (2010) evaluated the efficiency of schema therapy. He concluded that schema therapy reduced anxiety disorder in female patients \((p<0.001)\).

Khorshidzadeh (2011) used schema therapy in order to reduce the symptoms of social anxiety disorder and the obtained results indicated a significantly meaningful reduce of the disorder.

The results of the current study confirmed the third hypothesis & fourth hypothesis of the study. Based on the third & forth hypothesis of the study, difficulty identifying – describing & thinking objectively post – test & follow up mean scores of theatre therapy group is different & more useful than schema therapy group. According to the results of the study theater therapy with schema concept was more effective than schema therapy in reducing Alexithymia scales. Theatre therapy is one of the experimental and practical methods of psychotherapy. Emphasizing the practical techniques, psychodrama associated therapy with experimental dimensions of the disorder and provides patients an opportunity to express their inner feelings in an experimental and interpersonal context. Moreno believe that most of people need to fulfill their needs and to response practically to stimulus rather than merely to talk about them (blatner, 2000).

One the inherent characteristic of psychodrama theory is showing inner manners and facts via group role playing. By role playing, patients would be able to identify and express their emotions. Thus, their Alexithmia symptoms would be reduced. Psychodrama uses stage facilitates to recreate and anticipate events in a controlled manner. Consequently, patient’s emotions would be indentified, defined and expressed. Failure to identify and express emotions properly is one the symptoms of Alexithemia that could be reduced by drama. The results of the current hypothesis are in line with the obtained results by Mahdi Zare (2006). He investigated the effects of rational - emotional and behavioral group therapy and psychodrama on styles of expressing emotions. He concluded that both of the approaches have positive effects on emotion expression and theatre therapy with schema concept is more effective.
References


Blatner, a. (2003). An interview with adamblatner about psychodrama ..nourthamerican journal of psychology .vol 5- no1 , 137-146.


